



SUDBURY CATHOLIC DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD

165A D'YOUVILLE STREET, SUDBURY, ONTARIO P3C 5E7 tel. (705) 673-5620 fax (705) 673-8918
<http://www.scdsb.edu.on.ca>

Report To: Chairperson Jody Cameron and Members of the Board	Report Date:	2010-03-17
	Meeting Date:	2010-03-23
Subject Matter: Director of Education's Report for the East Planning Area		
Submitted by: Catherine McCullough, Director of Education		
Our File: B01-A10		

ISSUE:

The work of the 2009-2010 Accommodation Review Committee (ARC) for the East Planning Area culminated in a March 3, 2010 submission titled "*School Valuation Reports and Recommendations to the Director of Education*". The Board Regulation BR10 – Pupil/School Accommodation Review requires Board staff to review and analyze the report of the ARC, and to prepare a report and recommendations to the Board.

BACKGROUND:

The members of the ARC are to be commended for their commitment to a process that included many meetings since February 17, 2009, when the Board resolved to begin this process.

The ARC was chaired by Roland Muzzatti, Academic Superintendent. Steve Rinaldi, Project Coordinator, was designated ARC Secretary and, along with Denis Faucher, Manager of Facility Services, ARC Coordinator, and Dennis Bazinet, Acting Superintendent of Business and Finance, Senior ARC Official, formed the Board representation and ARC Steering Committee, that provided additional resources for use by the ARC as required.

The services of Ms. Lygia Dallip, Education Sector Manager, Watson and Associates Economists Ltd., were utilized as ARC Facilitator to provide counsel to the ARC Steering Committee in adhering to the spirit and intent of the Ministry of Education's Pupil Accommodation Review process.



SUDBURY CATHOLIC DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD

165A D'YOUVILLE STREET, SUDBURY, ONTARIO P3C 5E7 tel. (705) 673-5620 fax (705) 673-8918
<http://www.scdsb.edu.on.ca>

The ARC has fulfilled its mandate to study, report and make recommendations on the accommodation options respecting the East Planning Area's family of schools that consist of:

Pius XII Elementary School (Sudbury)

(Currently offers Regular and Special Education programs, Grades JK to 8)

St. Albert Adult Learning Centre (Sudbury)

(Currently offers adult learning programs)

St. Andrew Elementary School (Sudbury)

(Currently offers Regular programs, Grades JK to 6)

St. Bernadette Elementary School (Sudbury)

(Currently offers French Immersion programs, Grades JK to 6)

St. Charles College (Sudbury)

(Currently offers Dual-track, Regular and French Immersion programs, Grades 9 to 12)

St. John Elementary School (Garson)

(Currently offers Dual-track, Regular and French Immersion programs, Grades JK to 8)

St. Mark Elementary School (Markstay)

(Currently offers Regular programs, Grades JK to 6)

St. Paul Elementary School (Coniston)

(Currently offers Dual-track, Regular and French Immersion programs, Grades JK to 8)

St. Raphael Elementary School (Sudbury)

(Currently offers Regular and Special Education programs, Grades JK to 8
as well as French Immersion programs, Grades 7-8)

STAFF ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS:

Board staff has reviewed the ARC Report to the Director as submitted on March 3, 2010, and their findings and recommendations are as follows:

ARC Recommendation #1 proposes the consolidation of St. Andrew, St. Bernadette and St. Raphael Elementary Schools into a new Dual Track JK to Grade 8 School, with all other schools remaining status quo. This scenario does address the current and future deferred capital cost by consolidating facilities, but does not offer a long-term solution to the falling utilization rate projected for St. Charles College, nor does it propose any enhancement to the current secondary school environment or programming.

ARC Recommendation #2 proposes the consolidation of St. Andrew, St. Bernadette and St. Raphael Elementary Schools into a new Dual Track JK to Grade 6 School, with 7 to 12 programming offered at St. Charles College for all schools in this planning area. This scenario does address the current and future deferred capital cost by consolidating facilities, and the falling utilization rate projected for St. Charles College together with the enhanced learning opportunities of 7 to 12 programming. This scenario has a negative effect on the utilization rates of St. John and St. Paul Elementary Schools with the consolidation of the 7 and 8 students.



SUDBURY CATHOLIC DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD

165A D'YOUVILLE STREET, SUDBURY, ONTARIO P3C 5E7 tel. (705) 673-5620 fax (705) 673-8918
<http://www.scdsb.edu.on.ca>

ARC Recommendation #3 proposes that, if the Ministry of Education chooses not to fund the construction of a new school, the Board should consolidate St. Andrew and St. Bernadette Elementary Schools into St. Raphael Elementary School, and offer all 7 to 12 programming at St. Charles College. This scenario does address the current and future deferred capital cost by consolidating some facilities and the falling utilization rate projected for St. Charles College together with the enhanced learning opportunities of 7 to 12 programming. This scenario has a negative effect on the utilization rates of St. John and St. Paul Elementary Schools with the consolidation of the 7 and 8 students.

Board staff presented the ARC with an overview of the Board at the start of its deliberations outlining the opportunity to creatively respond to the challenges of declining enrolment, declining revenues, and physically deteriorating schools in a way that will provide 'Good Places to Learn' for our students now and for the future.

This Board overview presentation also stated that, in this planning area, the Board does not need all of its current schools, as there is considerable projected surplus space in the Board's elementary and secondary schools, suggesting that there is scope to consolidate programming.

The ARC, over the past eight months, has engaged in comprehensive conversations (included 12 working meetings and 4 public meetings), which has shaped the recommendations described above. ARC members are to be praised for their work as they strived to develop possible solutions to address declining enrolment, aging facilities and surplus and spaces in this planning area.

Trustees will recall their decisions regarding the accommodation reviews of the North/West and South/Central planning areas. This implementation of these decisions will overextend the Board's capacity from a human resource perspective and a financial ability perspective.

Staff supports a consistent educational approach in all three planning areas, thereby considering enhanced programming (Grades 7 to 12), while maintaining the viability of Catholic education in single-school communities. Also, the viability of 7-12 programming was articulated to all the stakeholders: the members of the ARC, Trustees, the members of the public in attendance at Public Meeting #4 and to the staff at St. Charles College.

The climate at the provincial level has changed considerably since the beginning of this ARC process. We have been reminded that the Ontario Government's Provincial deficit is projected to grow to \$24.7B. The Ministry of Education has yet to announce any formal capital programs for school boards.

The Ministry of Education also introduced the Early Learning Program which will begin its implementation in September 2010.

Our Board has also recently undertaken an extensive Information Technology Review. Both of these new initiatives will also overextend our system resources.



SUDBURY CATHOLIC DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD

165A D'YOUVILLE STREET, SUDBURY, ONTARIO P3C 5E7 tel. (705) 673-5620 fax (705) 673-8918
<http://www.scdsb.edu.on.ca>

DIRECTOR'S RECOMMENDATIONS:

“THAT the Board not proceed, at this time, with the consolidation of any schools in this planning area, and

THAT the Director will continue to monitor the enrolment at St. Charles College and continue to dialogue with the school communities with respect to the possible implementation of Grade 7 to 12 programming at St. Charles College, and

THAT the Director will continue to dialogue with the Ministry of Education to advocate for capital funds for our aging facilities.”

A Special Meeting of the Board is scheduled for **Tuesday, April 27, 2010** at 7:00 p.m. at the Sudbury Catholic DSB, Catholic Education Centre, Board Room. The purpose of this Special Board Meeting is to provide an opportunity for the public to make formal presentations to the Board concerning Staff's findings, the ARC School Valuation Reports and Recommendations, and the Director of Education's Recommendations.

The Special Board Meeting scheduled for **Tuesday, May 25, 2010** at 7:00 p.m. at the Sudbury Catholic DSB, Catholic Education Centre, Board Room, is intended for the Board to make its decision regarding the school accommodation recommendations. This Special Board Meeting is another opportunity for the public to make formal presentations to the Board concerning the Staff findings and Recommendations, the ARC School Valuation Reports and Recommendations, and the Director of Education's Recommendations.

Finally, the recommendations herein are intended to provide the students under our care with a Catholic education that is of the highest quality possible.

Given all the rationale described above, the following recommendation is respectfully submitted.

“THAT the Sudbury Catholic District School Board receive the Director of Education's Report for the East Planning Area, dated March 17, 2010.”

Enrolment Projections

SUDBURY CATHOLIC DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD

Scenario Builder

Proposed Scenario: **St. Andrew, St. Bernadette and St. Raphael to a New School at St. Bernadette site; with St. Raphael and Pius XII Grade 7 & 8's to SCC (with Multi-Media Centre)**

St. Raphael

Description: **moved to New School at SCC campus and CLOSES**

	2009 OTG	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2009 - 2023 Avg. Util
School Name		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Total Enrolment	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Utilization Rate		#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!	#DIV/0!
# of Classrooms Available/ Required		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	#DIV/0!

NEW ELEMENTARY SCHO Description: **JK to 6 Dual-Track (SE from St. Raphael & Pius; FI boundary change)**

	2009 OTG	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2009 - 2023 Avg. Util
St. Raphael (JK - 6 RT)		303	226	285	271	256	255	265	266	268	268	270	266	264	260	254	
St. Raphael (SE)		34	30	34	34	34	34	34	34	34	34	34	34	34	34	34	
Pius XII (SE)		20	31	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	
St. Andrew (JK - 6 RT)		137	145	154	153	150	142	141	141	141	140	139	140	140	141	140	
St. Bernadette (JK - 6 FI)		68	90	73	71	67	70	68	70	69	69	69	69	69	68	68	
St. Paul (JK - 6 FI) - Minnow Lake		39	39	43	44	45	45	46	45	45	44	44	44	43	43	42	
Total Enrolment	600	602	561	609	593	572	566	574	575	577	574	575	572	570	566	558	
Utilization Rate		100%	93%	101%	99%	95%	94%	96%	96%	96%	96%	96%	95%	95%	94%	93%	96%
# of Classrooms Available/ Required		0	-2	0	0	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-1	-2	

St. Charles College Description: **7 to 12 Dual-Track (St. Raphael & Pius 7&8's)**

	2009 OTG	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2009 - 2023 Avg. Util
St. Charles College (Grd. 9 - 12 RT & FI)		860	936	822	789	743	672	647	627	577	591	604	603	620	601	597	
St. Raphael (Grd. 7 - 8 RT)		131	131	167	141	151	134	102	99	106	106	104	108	114	115	116	
St. Raphael (Grd. 7 - 8 FI)		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
St. Paul (Grd. 7 - 8 FI) - Minnow Lake		7	8	9	8	8	8	9	10	10	10	9	9	9	9	9	
Pius XII (Grd. 7 - 8 RT)		53	54	50	52	50	55	51	47	48	46	46	44	43	43	44	
Total Enrolment	1,080	1,051	1,128	1,049	990	952	869	809	783	742	753	763	764	787	768	766	
Utilization Rate		97%	104%	97%	92%	88%	80%	75%	73%	69%	70%	71%	71%	73%	71%	71%	79%
# of Classrooms Available/ Required		-1	2	-1	-4	-6	-9	-12	-13	-15	-14	-14	-14	-13	-14	-14	

	2009 OTG	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2009 - 2023 Avg. Util
Total Elementary Enrolm	1,623	1,307	1,286	1,373	1,346	1,319	1,316	1,336	1,342	1,348	1,334	1,332	1,325	1,323	1,315	1,301	
Utilization Rate		81%	79%	85%	83%	81%	81%	82%	83%	83%	82%	82%	82%	82%	81%	80%	82%
# of Classrooms Available/ Required		-14	-15	-11	-12	-13	-13	-12	-12	-12	-13	-13	-13	-13	-13	-14	

Notes:

"# of Classrooms Available/ Required" = (Total Enrolment - 2007 OTG)/ Average number of Students per Class

The calculation for "# of Classrooms Available/ Required" is based on an average of 23 students per class regardless of program (RT vs. FI)

A positive number indicates a potential need for portables while a negative number indicates surplus classroom space available in the school

The number of classrooms available/ required has the potential to be impacted by grade structure and specialized programs available at the school

Financial Summary

Status Quo

School Name	2009 OTG	Renewal Needs	
		2008/09	2013/14
Pius XII	315	\$ 3,887,051	\$ 4,701,968
St. Andrew	201	\$ 1,829,563	\$ 2,468,178
St. Bernadette	135	\$ 1,737,811	\$ 2,447,741
St. John	368	\$ 2,269,579	\$ 2,832,381
St. Mark	69	\$ -	\$ -
St. Paul	386	\$ 3,154,891	\$ 5,338,750
St. Raphael	539	\$ 5,160,976	\$ 7,851,532
St. Charles College	1,080	\$ 8,431,271	\$ 14,584,341
St. Albert Adult Learning Centre	210	\$ 2,063,806	\$ 3,706,613
TOTAL	3,303	\$ 28,534,948	\$ 43,931,503
TOTAL excluding St. Albert Adult Learning Centre	3,093	\$ 26,471,141	\$ 40,224,890

Proposed Scenario St. Andrew, St. Bernadette and St. Raphael to a New School at St. Bernadette site; with St. Raphael and Pius XII Grade 7 & 8's to SCC (with Multi-Media Centre)

School Name	2009 OTG	New School Construction	Cost of New School	Demolition Costs	Renewal Needs		Construction/ Renovation	Revised Renewal
					2008/09	2013/14		
Pius XII	200	--	\$ 3,500,000	\$500,000	\$ 3,887,051	\$ 2,051,589		\$ 2,051,589
St. Andrew	0	--	--		--	--		
St. Bernadette	0	--	--		--	--		
St. John	368	--	--		\$ 2,269,579	\$ 2,832,381		\$ 2,832,381
St. Mark	69	--	--		\$ -	\$ -		
St. Paul	386	--	--		\$ 3,154,891	\$ 5,338,750		\$ 5,338,750
St. Raphael	0	--	--		--	--		
NEW ELEMENTARY SCHOOL	600	600	\$ 11,889,897	\$500,000	na	na		
St. Charles College	1,080	--	\$ 4,000,000		\$ 8,431,271	\$ 14,584,341		\$ 14,584,341
		--	--		--	--		\$ 3,706,613
TOTAL	2,703	600	\$ 19,389,897	\$ 1,000,000	\$ 17,742,791	\$ 24,807,061	\$ -	\$ 28,513,673
Diff Compared to Status Quo Scenario	(600)	--	\$ 20,389,897	\$ (10,792,157)	\$ (19,124,442)			

PLEASE NOTE: This option will require additional funds from the Ministry of Education