



# SUDBURY CATHOLIC DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD

165A D'YOUVILLE STREET, SUDBURY, ONTARIO P3C 5E7 tel. (705) 673-5620 fax (705) 673-6670  
<http://www.scdsb.edu.on.ca>

**MINUTES** of the **8<sup>th</sup> WORKING SESSION** of the Accommodation Review Committee (ARC) for the East Planning Area, of the Sudbury Catholic District School Board (SCDSB), held in the gymnasium of St. Paul Elementary School, 1 Edward Avenue, in Coniston, on January 5, 2010, from 6:00 p.m. to 8:30 p.m.

## Committee Members in Attendance:

### Board Representation:

Chairperson	Roland Muzzatti, Academic Superintendent
Senior Board Official	Dennis Bazinet, Acting Superintendent of Business and Finance
Coordinator	Denis Faucher, Manager of Facility Services
Secretary	Steve Rinaldi, Project Coordinator

### School Representation:

#### Pius XII

Louisa Bianchin, Principal  
Shelley Sloan, School Council Chair  
Cathy Manuel, Community  
Leonard Foucault, School Staff

#### St. John

Tricia Dowdall-Cirelli, Principal  
Amanda Gagne, School Council Chair  
Tara Large, School Staff

#### St. Albert Adult Learning Centre (ALC)

Cassandra MacGregor, Vice-Principal  
Ann Brisebois, School Staff  
Katrina Chevrier,

#### St. Mark

Sharon Oliver, Principal  
Stacey Kennedy, Community  
Carole Remillard, School Staff

#### St. Andrew

Melody Henry, Principal  
Mary Smith, School Council Chair  
Lucille Szalai, Community

#### St. Paul

Sharon Oliver, Principal  
Anne-Marie Savage, School Council Chair  
Jennifer Rocca, Community  
Natasha Folino, School Staff

#### St. Bernadette

Nicole Snow, Principal  
Dan Bronicheski, School Council Chair  
Colette Perrin, School Staff  
Mike McKeever

#### St. Raphael

Vickie McGuire, Principal  
Ted Keehn, School Staff  
Jennifer Bailey, Community

#### St. Charles College

Patty Mardero, Principal  
Claire Morrison, School Staff  
Catherine Ross-Gonko, St. Charles College  
Sandra Gobbo, St. Charles College

### Community Representation:

Fr. Remi Hebert, Diocesan Representative  
Mark Simeoni, City of Greater Sudbury

**Committee Members Regrets:**

Clara Steele, Regional Parent Involvement Committee  
Francine Dubreuil, St. Albert  
Dyan Pyott, School Staff  
Tina Madore, Community  
Donna Kotanko, School Council Chair  
Phil Farmer, School Council Chair

**General Public in Attendance:**

Nora Gauthier, Pius XII  
Allison Dufour, St. Albert A.L.C.  
Dave Sisk, Community  
Jean McHarg, SCDSB

**Call to Order:**

Chair Roland Muzzatti called the meeting to order at 6 p.m.

**OPENING PRAYER**

The Chair led the group in an opening prayer for guiding presence.

**WELCOME**

Mr. Muzzatti wished the group a Happy New Year and welcomed the group to ARC Working Meeting #8 and thanked everyone for attending. He also thanked Mrs. Sharon Oliver principal of St. Paul Elementary School and her team for hosting the meeting and providing food and refreshments. He also thanked the group for their flexibility with rescheduling the meeting from December 9, 2009 that was cancelled due to inclement weather.

**APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA**

**MOVED BY S. Oliver and Seconded by N. Snow**

**“THAT the agenda for today’s January 5, 2010 Working Meeting #8 be approved as presented”.**

**CARRIED**

**ARC BINDERS**

The Chair reviewed the updates to the ARC binders that included minutes from the Working Meeting #7 and this evening’s presentation package.

**APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES**

**MOVED BY S. Sloan and Seconded by L. Szalai**

**“THAT the minutes from the 7<sup>th</sup> Working Meeting be approved as presented”.**

**CARRIED**

**SUBDIVISION ACTIVITY**

Mr. Muzzatti introduced Mr. Mark Simeoni, ARC member, Senior Planner for the City of Greater Sudbury, to respond to a request from ARC for updated information concerning planned commercial/residential development in this planning area. Mr. Simeoni described Sudbury as a large Northern Ontario community with challenges in regards to population growth. Mr. Simeoni reviewed the Subdivision Activity Plans included in tonight’s presentation package, identifying that the number and location of registered lots are good indications of where the private sector believe there is demand for development.

### **Grade 7 to 12 Programming**

Mr. Muzzatti introduced Jean McHarg, Superintendent of Education & Academic Programs JK-12. Mrs. McHarg thanked the committee for allowing her to address the group. Mrs. McHarg stated that she has been involved with the Student Success Initiative for the past 6 years, since it was introduced in 2003, to address the problem with students at risk of not graduating. Mrs. McHarg explained that in 2004, Dr. Allan King did a study about where students go after secondary school which concluded that 34% go to university, 20% go to college, 6% go into apprenticeships and 40% leave before graduating or go directly to the workplace, and that the reasons why students were dropping out included a feeling that no one cared, they had no connection to the adults in the school and had no hope of meeting the curriculum expectations. Mrs. McHarg further explained that Dr. Allan King's study recommended that in order for students to be successful they had to have a sense of being, belonging, becoming, and that it found that the fewest school transitions possible are the best for students.

Mrs. McHarg stated that the Board is proposing one transition between elementary and secondary from grade 6 to grade 7, which would also allow students greater access to facilities (shops, sports programs, musical instruments), and more familiar with the teachers in the secondary school, helping to reduce the fear factor of going from grade 8 to grade 9. Mrs. McHarg stated that it would also make it easier for teachers to discuss and understand the students that are in the system, and there would be more access to specialty teachers.

The following questions were posed by committee members and responded to by Mrs. McHarg:

- Q. Is a separate wing at St. Charles College a reality or a possibility? Why move when we have available space at St. Raphael?
- A. The intention is that the grade 7 and 8 classes would be provided within a separate wing, with a physical separation at the beginning, which would evolve over time.
- Q. Does a child in Minnow Lake have the option to attend St. Bernadette?
- A. Yes, without consortium transportation available.

Mr. Muzzatti spoke to the group about the challenges within this planning area, and identified that at this stage of the accommodation process, the group should focus on possible options. Chair Muzzatti suggested that the group considers how successful Marymount Academy has been with its 7-12 programming, and reminded that all options tabled will be voted on by the ARC to accept or reject, in preparation for the next Public Meeting #3.

### **BOUNDARY MAPS**

Mr. Muzzatti introduced Mr. Dennis Bazinet, Acting Superintendent of Business and Finance who reviewed that current boundary maps with the group, in order to clarify exactly which schools students would attend based on their home address.

### **ACCOMMODATION OPTIONS**

Mr. Muzzatti reviewed the options brought forth at Working Meeting #7, identifying the changes to "Status Quo" as follows:

- Option #1      Marymount Secondary students to St. Charles College (Grade 7 to 12)  
Multi-Media Centre at St. Charles College  
St. Andrew students to St. Raphael  
4-unit Portapak at St. Raphael
- Option #2      Marymount Secondary students to St. Charles College (Grade 7 to 12)  
Multi-Media Centre at St. Charles College  
St. Andrew students to St. Raphael  
All grade 7 & 8 programming to St. Charles College  
8-unit Portapak at St. Charles College  
St. Bernadette students to Pius XII

- Option #3 All Grade 7 & 8 programming to St. Charles College  
4-unit Portapak at St. Charles College  
St. Andrew students to St. Raphael  
St. Bernadette students to Pius XII
- Option #4 Grade 7 & 8 from Pius XII and St. Raphael programs to St. Charles College  
Multi-Media Centre at St. Charles College  
St. Andrew students to St. Raphael  
St. Bernadette students to Pius XII
- Option #5 Grade 7 & 8 from Pius XII and St. Raphael programs to St. Charles College  
St. Andrew students to St. Raphael
- Option #6 Grade 7 & 8 from Pius XII and St. Raphael programs to St. Charles College  
St. Bernadette students to St. Raphael
- Option #7 Grade 7 & 8 from Pius XII and St. Raphael programs to St. Charles College  
St. Andrew and St. Bernadette students to St. Raphael
- Option #8 New dual-track JK to 6 on St. Bernadette site  
St. Andrew, St. Bernadette and St. Raphael to new school and close  
Acquisition of city owned property between St. Bernadette and St. Charles College  
St. Raphael grade 7 and 8 programming to St. Charles College
- Option #9 New dual-track JK to 8 on St. Bernadette site (detached school)  
St. Andrew, St. Bernadette and St. Raphael to new school and close  
Acquisition of city owned property between St. Bernadette and St. Charles College
- Option #10 All Grade 7 and 8 students to St. Charles College  
St. Andrew and St. Bernadette to St. Raphael and close
- Option #11 All Grade 7 and 8 students to St. Charles College  
St. Andrew and St. Bernadette to St. Raphael; St. Bernadette closes  
St. Mark to St. Paul and closes  
St. Albert to St. Andrew and closes
- Option #12 All Grade 7 and 8 students to St. Charles College  
St. Mark to St. Paul and closes  
St. Andrew and St. Bernadette to St. Raphael and close  
St. Albert to St. Andrew and closes

Mr. Muzzatti then opened the floor for discussion, and committee members put forth the following options:

- Option #13 New dual-track JK to 8 on St. Bernadette site  
St. Andrew, St. Bernadette, St. Raphael and Pius XII to new school at St. Bernadette site and close  
Multi-Media Centre at St. Charles College  
St. Albert moves to St. Andrew and closes
- Option #14 St. Andrew, St. Bernadette and St. Raphael JK-SK to St. Andrew  
St. Andrew and St. Bernadette's Grade 1-6 to St. Raphael, and St. Bernadette closes  
St. Raphael's Grade 7 and 8 students to St. Charles College

- Option #15 Pius XII becomes a JK to 6 dual-track school with a portion of St. Paul's French Immersion students, and St. Raphael's Special Education students  
 St. Bernadette becomes a JK to 8 dual-track school  
 Pius XII, St. John, St. Mark, St. Paul and St. Raphael Grade 7 and 8 students to St. Bernadette  
 St. John and St. Paul become JK to 6 dual-track schools  
 St. Mark and St. Raphael become JK to 6 school schools
- Option #16 St. Raphael's Special Education students to Pius XII

Chair Muzzatti stated that Board staff would take these options, and generate tables that reveal the projected enrolment based on the Watson and Associates demographic report, and the subsequent school utilization for each of these scenarios. The "Scenario Builder" table for the "Status Quo" option was distributed to the group and Mr. Bazinet reviewed with the group.

The following questions were posed by committee members and responded to by Mr. Bazinet

- Q. What is the ideal school utilization percentage?  
 A. There is a difference between on the ground capacity and what the school really needs to operate. We strive to fill classrooms as much as possible. The Ministry is encouraging 80 to 85%. Dual track programs will require additional space. The ministry wants school boards to maximize school utilization as much as possible.
- Q. Some schools seem to be able to maintain their student population and others don't. Are there updated numbers that show the current actual retention trend?  
 A. From June of 2009 into September/October of 2009, approximately 200 elementary students were lost. Enrolment is declining but not necessarily everywhere and at the same rate. Watson expects that secondary will decline within the next two years.

### **FINANCIAL SUMMARY**

Mr. Muzzatti introduced Mr. Denis Faucher, Manager of Facility Services, to review the financial summary contained within the "Scenario Builder" tables, for the 'Status Quo' scenario, with the group.

Mr. Faucher stated that the financial summary outlines the Ministry of Education's replacement value for each school, together with the required replacement costs of each schools aging components. Mr. Faucher identified that in 2003, the Ministry hired a firm to visit all 6,000 provincial schools to list the mechanical, electrical and architectural components of the buildings, and to determine the components life expectancy, replacement requirement and replacement cost. Mr. Faucher also clarified that the annual funding received from the Ministry is a very small percentage of the required annual replacement costs, creating an ever increasing cost identified as deferred capital. Mr. Faucher stated that the deferred capital requirements are currently funded from two programs, called Good Places to Learn (GPL) and Facilities Renewal Program (FRP).

The following questions were posed by committee members and responded to by Mr. Faucher

- Q. In the South/Central Planning Area, a new school was approved based on closing four (4) schools that were identified as Prohibitive to Repair (PTR). Do we have a similar opportunity in the East?  
 A. The PTR program has been cancelled by the Ministry, although we do have sections at Pius and St. Raphael that had qualified as PTR.
- Q. Can we alter/edit current options?  
 A. Yes.

Mr. Muzzatti then reviewed option #1 to #3, identifying that these were from the November 2008 Watson and Associate Report to the Board, involve a planning area where decisions have already been made and call for the placement of portables, an option that Trustees have made clear they will never support the use of. The Chair then outlined how option #8 to #12 were generated through ARC discussion at Working Meeting #7, and that option #13 to #16 were subsequently submitted by ARC members.

**MOVED BY C. Perrin and Seconded by C. Morrison**

**“THAT the meeting be extended until 8:30 p.m.**

**CARRIED**

### **SUMMARY OF OPTIONS**

The Chair called on Mr. Bazinet to review the chart included in tonight’s presentation package that illustrates the summary of accommodation options currently under ARC consideration. Mr. Bazinet reviewed, explaining that this visual may assist members in identifying schools to remain open, their curriculum programming and how the option compares to the status quo.

### **TASK FOR NEXT WORKING MEETING**

Chair Muzzatti stated that the task for the next meeting is to prepare for the presentation of accommodation options for the ARC’s Public Meeting #3.

### **QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS**

Mr. Muzzatti reviewed the three (3) items received, for ARC consideration, as follows:

Item #1 (email submission):

Handout’s were provided to the group outlining additional grants that are over and above the regular funding that is received specific to St. Mark Elementary School. If St. Mark’s were to close, these grants would be lost. It was discussed that the funding received is sufficient to pay for all current costs associated with the operation of this program.

Item #2 (email submission)

The Board’s Scent Awareness Program literature was provided.

Question #3 (email submission)

Due to time constraints, this question was tabled for the next Working Meeting.

### **NEXT MEETINGS**

Chair Muzzatti closed the meeting by again thanking the committee and reminded the group that the next meeting would be **Working Meeting # 9 at St. Raphael Elementary, on Wednesday, January 6, 2010 from 6:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m.** and that the next Public Meeting will held on **Wednesday, January 13, 2010 from 7:00 to 9:00 p.m. at St. Charles College, Sudbury.**

**MOVED BY L. Bianchin and Seconded by S. Sloan**

**“THAT the East Planning Area ARC Working Meeting #8 be adjourned”.**

**CARRIED**

### **CLOSING PRAYER**

Meeting Adjourned at 8:30pm.

Roland Muzzatti, Chair  
Sudbury Catholic District School Board