



SUDBURY CATHOLIC DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD

165A D'YOUVILLE STREET, SUDBURY, ONTARIO P3C 5E7 tel. (705) 673-5620 fax (705) 673-6670
<http://www.scdsb.edu.on.ca>

MINUTES of the 9th **WORKING SESSION** of the Accommodation Review Committee (ARC) for the East Planning Area, of the Sudbury Catholic District School Board (SCDSB), held in the gymnasium of St. Raphael Elementary School, 1096 Dublin Street, in Sudbury, on January 6, 2010, from 6:00 p.m. to 9:00 p.m.

Committee Members in Attendance:

Board Representation:

Chairperson	Roland Muzzatti, Academic Superintendent
Senior Board Official	Dennis Bazinet, Acting Superintendent of Business and Finance
Facilitator	Denis Faucher, Manager of Facility Services
Secretary	Steve Rinaldi, Project Coordinator

School Representation:

Pius XII

Louisa Bianchin, Principal
Shelley Sloan, School Council Chair
Cathy Manuel, Community
Leonard Foucault, School Staff

St. Charles College

Patty Mardero, Principal
Catherine Ross-Gonko, School Council Chair
Sandra Gobbo, Community
Claire Morrison, School Staff

St. Albert Adult Learning Centre (ALC)

Cassandra MacGregor, Vice-Principal
Ann Brisebois, School Staff
Katrina Chevrier, Student Representative
Francine Dubreuil, Student Representative

St. John

Tricia Dowdall-Cirelli, Principal
Amanda Gagne, School Council Chair
Tina Madore, Community
Tara Large, School Staff

St. Andrew

Melody Henry, Principal
Mary Smith, School Council Chair
Lucille Szalai, Community
Dyan Pyott, School Staff

St. Mark

Sharon Oliver, Principal
Carole Remillard, School Staff
Stacey Kennedy, Community

St. Bernadette

Nicole Snow, Principal
Dan Bronicheski, School Council Chair
Mike McKeever, Community
Colette Perrin, School Staff

St. Paul

Sharon Oliver, Principal
Jennifer Rocca, Community

St. Raphael

Vickie McGuire, Principal
Phil Farmer, School Council Chair
Ted Keehn, School Staff
Jen Bailey, Community

Community Representation:

Fr. Remi Hebert, Diocesan Representative

Committee Members Regrets:

Donna Kotanko, St. Mark
Stacey Kennedy, St. Mark
Clara Steele, Regional Parent Involvement Committee

Anne-Marie Savage, St. Paul
Mark Simeoni, Greater City of Sudbury

2/12/2010

General Public in Attendance:

Nora Gauthier, Pius XII
Megan Murphy, Pius XII

Meghan O'Reilly, St. Mark
Allison Dufour, St. Albert ALC

Call to Order:

Chair Muzzatti called the meeting to order @ **6:05** p.m.

OPENING PRAYER

The Chair led the group in an opening prayer for guiding presence.

WELCOME

Mr. Muzzatti welcomed the group to ARC Working Meeting #9 and thanked everyone for attending. He also thanked Mrs. Vicki McGuire, principal of St. Raphael Elementary School, and her team for hosting the meeting and providing the food and refreshments.

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

MOVED BY N. Snow and **Seconded by** C. Remillard

“**THAT** the agenda for today’s January 6, 2010 Working Meeting #9 be approved as presented.”

CARRIED

ARC BINDERS

The Chair reviewed the updates to the ARC binders as included in this evening’s presentation package.

ACCOMMODATION OPTIONS

Mr. Muzzatti reviewed the ARC options as presented at Working Meeting #8 identifying the changes to “Status Quo” as follows:

- Option #1 Marymount Secondary students to St. Charles College (Grade 7 to 12)
Multi-Media Centre at St. Charles College
St. Andrew students to St. Raphael
4-unit Portapak at St. Raphael

- Option #2 Marymount Secondary students to St. Charles College (Grade 7 to 12)
Multi-Media Centre at St. Charles College
St. Andrew students to St. Raphael
All grade 7 and 8 programming to St. Charles College
8-unit Portapak at St. Charles College
St. Bernadette students to Pius XII

- Option #3 All Grade 7 and 8 programming to St. Charles College
4-unit Portapak at St. Charles College
St. Andrew students to St. Raphael
St. Bernadette students to Pius XII

- Option #4 Grade 7 and 8 from Pius XII and St. Raphael programs to St. Charles College
Multi-Media Centre at St. Charles College
St. Andrew students to St. Raphael
St. Bernadette students to Pius XII

- Option #5 Grade 7 and 8 from Pius XII and St. Raphael programs to St. Charles College
St. Andrew students to St. Raphael and closes
- Option #6 Grade 7 and 8 from Pius XII and St. Raphael programs to St. Charles College
St. Bernadette students to St. Raphael and closes
- Option #7 Grade 7 and 8 from Pius XII and St. Raphael programs to St. Charles College
St. Andrew and St. Bernadette students to St. Raphael
- Option #8 New dual-track JK to 6 on St. Bernadette site
St. Andrew, St. Bernadette and St. Raphael to new school and close
Acquisition of city owned property between St. Bernadette and St. Charles College
St. Raphael grade 7 and 8 programming to St. Charles College
- Option #9 New dual-track JK to 8 on St. Bernadette site (detached school)
St. Andrew, St. Bernadette and St. Raphael to new school and close
Acquisition of city owned property between St. Bernadette and St. Charles College
- Option #10 All Grade 7 and 8 students to St. Charles College
St. Andrew and St. Bernadette to St. Raphael and close
- Option #11 All Grade 7 and 8 students to St. Charles College
St. Andrew and St. Bernadette to St. Raphael; St. Bernadette closes
St. Mark to St. Paul and closes
St. Albert to St. Andrew and closes
- Option #12 All Grade 7 and 8 students to St. Charles College
St. Mark to St. Paul and closes
St. Andrew and St. Bernadette to St. Raphael and close
St. Albert to St. Andrew and closes
- Option #13 New dual-track JK to 8 on St. Bernadette site
St. Andrew, St. Bernadette, St. Raphael and Pius XII to new school at St. Bernadette site and close
Multi-Media Centre at St. Charles College
St. Albert moves to St. Andrew and closes
- Option #14 St. Andrew, St. Bernadette and St. Raphael JK-SK to St. Andrew
St. Andrew and St. Bernadette's Grade 1-6 to St. Raphael, and St. Bernadette closes
St. Raphael's Grade 7 and 8 students to St. Charles College
- Option #15 Pius XII becomes a JK to 6 dual-track school with a portion of St. Paul's French Immersion
students, and St. Raphael's Special Education students
St. Bernadette becomes a JK to 8 dual-track school
Pius XII, St. John, St. Mark, St. Paul and St. Raphael Grade 7 and 8 students to St. Bernadette
St. John and St. Paul become JK to 6 dual-track schools
St. Mark and St. Raphael become JK to 6 school schools
- Option #16 St. Raphael's Special Education students to Pius XII

Mr. Muzzatti then opened the floor for discussion, and committee members put forth the following options:

- Option #17 New dual-track JK to 6 on St. Bernadette site (detached school)
St. Andrew, St. Bernadette, St. Raphael and Pius XII to new school and close
Acquisition of city owned property between St. Bernadette and St. Charles College
Grade 7 and 8 students from St. Raphael and Pius XII to SCC with MMC.

Option #18 St. Andrew, St. Bernadette and St. Raphael to New School and close Pius XII Grade 7 and 8 students to New School

Option #19 All Grade 7 and 8 students to St. Charles College with MMC
St. Andrew, St. Bernadette and St. Raphael to attend new dual-track JK to 6 school, and close

The following question was posed by a committee member and responded by the Chair:

Q: Can we limit the number of options that we present to the public to a maximum of three?

A: This is a suggestion that would have to be voted upon.

ARC ACCOMMODATION OPTIONS FOR PUBLIC MEETING #3

Mr. Muzzatti identified that there are three (3) criteria that should be met before proposing a selected option to the public. It must first pass the sanity test with the Ministry. Second, it must be focused on improving educational opportunities (i.e. value to the students). Lastly, it must be based on preserving and sustaining the future of Catholic education in this planning area.

MOVED BY N. Snow and Seconded by T. Keehn

“**THAT** Option #16 be removed as an ARC option.”

CARRIED

MOVED BY T. Keehn and Seconded by C. Remillard

“**THAT** Option #15 be removed as an ARC option.”

CARRIED

MOVED BY L. Bianchin and Seconded by M. Henry

“**THAT** Option #1 be removed as an ARC option.”

CARRIED

The following question was posed by a committee member and responded by the Chair:

Q: Can we have some time between motions to review before voting?

A: Yes.

MOVED BY M. Henry and Seconded by L. Bianchin

“**THAT** Option #2 be removed as an ARC option.”

CARRIED

MOVED BY C. Ross-Gonko and Seconded by S. Sloan

“**THAT** Option #3 be removed as an ARC option.”

CARRIED

MOVED BY L. Bianchin and Seconded by A. Brisebois

“**THAT** Option #4 be removed as an ARC option.”

CARRIED

Amendment to the Motion:

MOVED BY C. MacGregor and Seconded by D. Pyott

“**THAT** St. Albert will remain as status quo (t.b.d.) in Option #4.”

CARRIED

MOVED BY N. Snow and Seconded by L. Bianchin

“**THAT** Option #14 be removed as an ARC option.”

CARRIED

MOVED BY S. Sloan and Seconded by C. Ross-Gonko

“**THAT** Option #11 be amended to state the following:

- 1) Pius XII would be JK-6 Dual Track school with a Special Education Centre.
- 2) St. Paul would be JK-6 Dual Track school, with one boundary for Regular and French Immersion programming, in Coniston area only.
- 3) St. Albert would relocate to another site, consider leasing space, or relocate to another Catholic site, should be no cost to the board.
- 4) The following modifications to St. Charles College:
 - a. Separate/new wing and separate entrance for Grade 7 and 8 students.
 - b. Separate dividing doors/wall between elementary and secondary students (Grade 7-8 wing).
 - c. Multimedia centre, including gym, stage, cafeteria, art and music rooms.
 - d. Separate lunch periods and assemblies.
 - e. Separate buses for elementary and secondary students.
 - f. Bridging activities with Grade 8 students moving to secondary panel.
 - g. Theatre – Performing Arts area.

DEFEATED

The following question was posed by a committee member and responded by the Chair:

Q: Is this the forum to be making these kinds of specific changes or does this happen at another meeting. Is there a separate committee to go over these issues?

A: I agree that making such changes is being too specific at this point.

MOVED BY T. Dowdall-Cirelli and Seconded by C. MacGregor

“**THAT** the question be called, and cease debate on the amendment of Option #11.”

CARRIED

MOVED BY P. Farmer and Seconded by T. Keehn

“**THAT** Option #12 remain as an ARC option and be presented at Public Meeting #3.”

DEFEATED

MOVED BY C. Ross-Gonko and Seconded by D. Bronicheski

“**THAT** Option #13 remain as an ARC option and be presented at Public Meeting #3.”

DEFEATED

Amendment to the Motion:

MOVED BY L. Szalai and Seconded by D. Pyott

“**THAT** St. Albert be noted as to be determined (t.b.d.) in Option #13.”

CARRIED

MOVED BY L. Szalai and Seconded by M. Smith

“**THAT** Option # 10 remain as an ARC option and be presented at Public Meeting #3.”

DEFEATED

The following questions were posed by committee members and responded by the Chair:

Q: Can we amend Option #10 to include the addition of the Multi Media School at St. Charles College?

A: The Multi Media Centre is actually already included as a part of the addition of Grade 7 and 8 students being sent to St. Charles College with Grade 7-12 programming.

Q: How interested is the Ministry in the building of a new school in Sudbury versus a renovation of one of our current schools?

A: The Ministry knows that our Catholic Board has taken the accommodation review of our schools very seriously. Yes, they are interested in a long-term investment. I feel that the Ministry will approve an appropriate business case presented to them that includes a new school in the New Sudbury area, with the consolidation of 2-3 existing schools.

Q: Did we not secure the funding of a new school to be built in the South end of the city?

A: Yes, they granted \$11 million. The difference with the South Central end of the city is that it consisted of four (4) PTR schools, whereas we only have two (2) school sections identified as PTR in our area.

Q: Do we not own land at the St. Bernadette site which we could build a new school?

A: We would need to obtain a parcel of land between St. Bernadette and St. Charles that is owned by the City of Sudbury. We do not see that as being a major issue.

Q: In 5 years from now how many of our schools will be classified PTR?

A: In 5 years six (6) of our schools will be over 65% F.C.I. Only St. John and St. Charles College will not be, St. Charles College will be borderline.

Q: Would it be possible to not make any changes at St. Charles College and get funding from the Ministry for a new school?

A: That would pose a very weak argument.

Q: Would renovating and adding to St. Bernadette school be an option?

A: Any major renovations on that site would require a tear-down. Because of its location we would need to re-orient the building to create an entrance and exit at Auger Street for busing.

Q: Does the Board have any idea of how many students would be attracted to our Board with the addition of a new school with a Multi Media Centre?

A: No, because at the Elementary level you must be a Catholic student, whereas at the Secondary level it is open access. It would be very difficult to make an accurate guess.

Q: If the Grade 7 & 8 students are at the High School would they have to be practicing their faith?

A: Yes, the Education Act states that either the child or a parent of the child must be Catholic.

Q: Do we know how many Catholic children attend Public schools?

A: No, we do not have those figures, however, property tax does indicate support.

Q: Do you have the number of Separate Board students who have transferred to the Public Board in the last 5 years?

A: We are provided with a monthly enrollment report at the Elementary level indicating any change of students to another Board. Our numbers show a decline in enrollment at the Elementary level. To summarize that data over 5 years would be onerous.

MOVED BY C. MacGregor and Seconded by M. Henry

“THAT Option #9 remain as an ARC option and be presented at Public Meeting #3.”

CARRIED

MOVED BY S. Sloan and Seconded by M. Henry

“THAT Option #11 remain as an ARC option and be presented at Public Meeting #3.” **CARRIED**

Amendment to the Motion:

MOVED BY L. Bianchin and Seconded by S. Sloan

“THAT Pius XII becomes a JK-6 Dual Track School in Option #11.” **DEFEATED**

The following question was posed by a committee member and responded by the Chair:

Q: Would it be possible to make renovations at St. Raphael’s?

A: That would be a part of the recommendations we would make to the Director. That would be a recommendation we would bring to Public Meeting #4.

MOVED BY L. Foucault and Seconded by C. Perrin

“THAT tonight’s meeting be extended until 8:30 p.m.” **CARRIED**

MOVED BY P. Mardero and Seconded by V. McGuire

“THAT Option #8 be removed as an ARC option.” **CARRIED**

MOVED BY L. Szalai and Seconded by C. MacGregor

“THAT Option #19 be presented as an ARC option at Public Meeting #3.” **CARRIED**

MOVED BY P. Farmer and Seconded by C. Remillard

“THAT there will be no more additional options or amendments made at this meeting.” **DEFEATED**

MOVED BY L. Foucault and Seconded by C. Remillard

“THAT there will be a maximum of four (4) options to be presented at Public Meeting #3.” **DEFEATED**

MOVED BY T. Dowdall-Cirelli and Seconded by T. Large

“THAT Option #7 remain as an ARC option and be presented at Public Meeting #3.” **CARRIED**

MOVED BY C. MacGregor and Seconded by S. Sloan

“THAT Option #5 be removed as an ARC option.” **CARRIED**

MOVED BY L. Foucault and Seconded by C. Perrin

“THAT Option #17 be presented as an ARC option at Public Meeting #3.” **DEFEATED**

MOVED BY P. Mardero and **Seconded by** S. Oliver

“**THAT** tonight’s meeting be extended until 9:00 p.m.”

CARRIED

MOVED BY C. MacGregor and **Seconded by** P. Mardero

“**THAT** Option #6 be removed as an ARC option.”

CARRIED

MOVED BY C. Ross-Gonko and **Seconded by** D. Bronicheski

“**THAT** Option #18 be presented as an ARC option at Public Meeting #3.”

CARRIED

APPROVAL OF AGENDA FOR PUBLIC MEETING #3

Mr. Muzzatti inquired the committee members as to whether or not they would like Watson & Associates to present at Public Meeting #3. If Watson & Associates are to present at the meeting, they would require a separate time to present their statistical data so as not to interfere with the presentation of the options to the public. If Watson & Associates do not make a presentation, they would be present at the meeting so that they would be available to answer any questions on demographics.

MOVED BY L. Foucault and **Seconded by** M. Henry

“**THAT** the agenda be adopted as outlined in slide #13 from Working Meeting #9 and that Watson & Associates attend, but not present at Public Meeting #3.”

CARRIED

MOVED BY L. Bianchin and **Seconded by** C. Morrison

“**THAT** Superintendent Jean McHarg be asked to be present at Public Meeting #3, to answer any questions regarding Grade 7-12 programming.”

CARRIED

TIMELINES AND MEETING SCHEDULE

Mr. Muzzatti reviewed the timeline and meeting schedule with the group.

TASK FOR NEXT WORKING MEETING

Mr. Muzzatti reminded the group that at Public Meeting #3 the ARC group will present options #7, #9, #11, #18 and #19 to the public, for their feedback. At the next Working Meeting, the committee members will review the feedback in order to draft the ARC’s recommendations to the Director.

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

Mr. Muzzatti reviewed an email received from the public, suggesting the ARC request some guarantee from the Board that the ARC recommendations are carried through without alteration.

Mr. Muzzatti stated that the ARC has the power to make recommendations to the Director of the Board who will either accept the recommendations, modify them, or reject them and come up with other recommendations to submit to the Board of Trustees. The Board of Trustees will receive the ARC recommendations along with the Director’s

recommendations. The Board of Trustees will then either accept them, modify them, or reject them and come up with their own recommendations. The Board of Trustees must give a rationale for any recommendations that they reject.

The following question was put forth by a committee member and responded to by the Chair:

Q: How are we going to respond to this parent?

A: It is up to the committee members to decide if or how they want to respond to this concern.

NEXT MEETING DATES

Chair Muzzatti closed the meeting by again thanking the committee and reminded the group that the next meeting would be Public Meeting #3, to be held on **Wednesday, January 13, 2009 from 7:00 to 9:00 p.m. at St. Charles College, 1940 Hawthorne Drive, Sudbury.** The next Working Meeting would be **Wednesday, January 20, 2010 from 6:00 to 8:00 p.m. at Pius XII, 44 Third Avenue, Sudbury.**

The meeting was concluded at 9:02 p.m. due to loss of quorum.

CLOSING PRAYER

Chair Muzzatti led the group in the closing prayer.

Roland Muzzatti, Chair
Sudbury Catholic District School Board